

Minutes

National Clinical Effectiveness Committee
Department of Health
15th June 2023, 13:30 – 15.15, virtual meeting

Members Present:

Professor Gerry Fitzpatrick

Chair, National Clinical Effectiveness Committee (NCEC)

Ms Christina Donnelly

Patient representation

Ms Karen Greene

Office of the Chief Nursing Officer (CNO),
Department of Health

Professor Anne Marie Brady

Nursing and Midwifery Education Bodies

Ms Collette Tully

National Office for Clinical Audit

Dr Siobhán Ní Bhríain

Office of the Chief Clinical Officer (CCO), Health
Service Executive (HSE)

Ms Michelle O'Neill

Health Information and Quality Authority (HIQA)

Mr Richard Lodge

Health and Social Care Regulatory Forum

Apologies:

Dr Máirín Ryan

Director HRB-CICER /Health Technology
Assessment & Deputy Chief Executive Officer
(HIQA)

Dr Cathal O'Keeffe

State Claims Agency (Head of Clinical Risk)

Dr Elaine Breslin

Health Products Regulatory Authority

Dr Geraldine Shaw

Office Nursing and Midwifery Services, HSE

Professor Colette Cowan

Forum of Hospital Groups CEOs

Dr Máiréad O'Driscoll

Health Research Board

Mr Donal Clancy

Health Insurance Council

Mr Gary Kiernan

Mental Health Commission Director of Regulation

Mr Pat Creedon

Acute Division, Department of Health

Mr John Hurley

Private Hospitals Association

Secretariat – Clinical Effectiveness Unit (CEU), Department of Health:

Rosarie Lynch

Head of Clinical Effectiveness and Antimicrobial Resistance, NPSO

Deirdre Holland, Dr. Michael Carton, Marion Cullen, Paul Dunphy

Clinical Effectiveness Unit (CEU), NPSO

In Attendance:

Kate O'Flaherty

Director National Patient Safety Office

Karen Cardwell

Health Information and Quality Authority (HIQA)

1. Welcome, introductions and apologies

The Chair welcomed all members to the first meeting of the National Clinical Effectiveness Committee (NCEC) in 2023. All those present were invited to introduce themselves at the beginning of the meeting. Apologies were noted as listed above.

2. Conflict of interest declarations (NCEC members)

In an email circulated the previous day the members had been requested to complete an e-form identifying if they had any Conflict of Interest. In addition, the members present at the meeting were invited to identify if they had any Conflict of Interest and a verbal pause held for same. No verbal declarations were made. The Chair reminded the members to submit annual declaration forms for Conflict of Interest.

3. Minutes

The Minutes of the meetings on 20th October 2022 and 1st December 2023 were reviewed. It was noted the action points listed in the minutes have been completed. NCEC members agreed that the minutes were an accurate reflection of the meetings.

4. Matters Arising

- a) CEU provided an update on one action item from the NCEC meeting of 20th October relating to the request to investigate the potential use of a proprietary system for managing the work of the committee. The Department of Health does not have licenses for a proprietary system at this time, but the CEU are exploring the use of a secure shared folder that only members of the committee and CEU can access. The use of an electronic form for declaring potential conflicts of interest, introduced at the 15th June meeting is also part of the review of how CEU can better support the work of the NCEC.
- b) NCEC National Clinical Guideline No. 30 Infection Prevention and Control was launched in May 2023. This NCG replaces the infection prevention and control elements of NCG No.2 Prevention and Control of Methicillin-Resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* (MRSA) and NCG No. 3. Surveillance, Diagnosis and Management of *Clostridium difficile* Infection in Ireland. A mapping exercise is underway to identify the elements of NCG No. 2 and No. 3 that will require further efforts to ensure guidance remains available to clinicians and patients. NCGs No. 2 and No. 3 will therefore remain part of the suite of NCEC guidelines until the mapping exercise has been completed.

5. NCEC Strategic Review

CEU presented the report on the NCEC Strategic Workshop that took place in December 2022 (report circulated in advance of the meeting as part of the meeting documentation). The purpose of the report was to reflect the feedback and preliminary analysis of the Strategic Workshop. CEU also gave an update on the overall strategic review of the work of the NCEC. This update included the range of inputs (including the Strategic Workshop Report), the outline of the report structure and the framework being used. The framework is based on the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform (DPER) document, 'Designing our Public Services, Design principles for Government in Ireland'. The Strategic Review will be completed by end of Quarter 3, 2023.

6. Prioritisation and QA – Summary Analysis

CEU circulated two papers for information providing summary analysis of the NCEC prioritisation and quality assurance processes (2015). Analysis reflects a consistently high standard of submissions to the process. Further analysis will be presented to the next meeting.

7. National Clinical Guidelines

- a) CEU gave a presentation on the Rapid Update report for NCG No.29 Unexpected Interoperative Life-Threatening Haemorrhage (circulated in advance). There was a brief discussion on the inclusion of the HSE logo on the poster, and it was considered that either in addition to or in place of the HSE logo, the poster should display the NCEC logo. With respect to the request to add the HSE logo to the poster, the NCEC discussed in particular, that as NCEC National Clinical Guidelines are for use in

both public (HSE-funded) and private healthcare settings, that the addition of the NCEC logo either in place of or in addition to the HSE logo would be appropriate. This was considered important to ensure the guideline (and poster as a key resource therein) is seen as applicable across all healthcare providers. In addition, this is consistent with the approach across the suite of NCEC National Clinical Guidelines, which display the NCEC logo on the front cover.

Decision: Accept the proposed changes, with the caveat that either in addition to or in place of the HSE logo, the poster should display the NCEC logo. The intended notice for the NCEC webpage is also accepted.

- b) CEU circulated two papers relating to the NCEC prioritisation process for CG-063 Obesity in Adults-Adapted Clinical Practice Guideline for Ireland, including the Prioritisation Team Report to the NCEC and a paper outlining further information with regards to the proposed guideline. There was lengthy and considered discussion among committee members, particularly in relation to fulfilment of criteria 5 (Variability in Practice) and 7 (Clinical Guideline Implementation). The commitment of the HSE to ongoing implementation of the National Clinical Programmes, not least the Obesity Programme was noted. The challenges associated with establishing and addressing variability in practice while implementation is ongoing were also acknowledged. A discussion point was also raised with regards to the decision to build clinical guideline development into the design and evolving implementation of the Obesity National Clinical Programme at a very early stage. Learning from the variability seen across other national programmes was credited as having provided the opportunity for this. Clarification is required with regards to the inclusion of pregnant women in the scope of the guideline, as well as considerations regarding age limits, as outlined in the Prioritisation Report.

Amendment requested to paper for further information. 'Support for implementation is evidenced by the approval of the obesity care pathway by the HSE Chief Clinical Officer's Clinical Advisory Committee' to be amended to 'Chief Clinical Officer's Clinical Forum'.

Whilst welcoming the work to date on this guideline, Dr Siobhán Ní Bhríain, in her role as National Clinical Director for Integrated Care, recused herself from the decision-making process. Dr Ní Bhríain also noted that the governance of the Obesity National Clinical Programme will be moving to that of the Chief Clinical Officer in the near future.

Decision: The clinical guideline proposal is successful and will be listed on the NCEC schedule of guidelines in development.

Action 2: Prioritisation Report and Letter to issue the Chair of CG-063 outlining the NCEC decision. CEU to engage with the GDG to progress the guideline to stage 3 of the Framework for Endorsement of NCEC NCGs.

8. Overview of Current Work Programme

- a) CEU presented an Excel list of NCGs/NCAs published and in development (circulated in advance).
- b) CEU gave an update on recent engagements:
 - a. NCCP guideline suite
 - b. NCG No. 26 Sepsis Management
 - c. NCG No. 14 Management of an Acute Asthma Attack in Adults

- d. NCG No. 17 Adult Type 1 Diabetes Mellitus (circulated in advance)

9. HRB-CICER

Dr Karen Cardwell gave an update on HRB-CICER activities as follows:

- HRB-CICER work is completed in line with a Quality Assurance Framework. This was first published in 2017, it updated and approved by the HIQA board in July 2022.
- HRB-CICER produce evidence syntheses to support guideline development groups. Since the last update, HRB-CICER completed and presented to the NCEC a review of processes to update clinical guidelines (completed February 2022 and presented to NCEC May 2022).
- HRB-CICER also completed a budget impact analysis to support the development of Infection prevention and control guideline. (Completed August 2022).
- Planned and on-going work includes the following:
 - Support NCEC on guidance for Updating Clinical Guidelines.
 - Methodological support to inform an update to the 2015 Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance, including updates to two of the review questions from the initial research in 2015 and one additional question.
 - Developing a tool to collect a core data set and collection/survey methodology for the collection of costs attributable to AMR at a point in time, to initially consider public healthcare perspective.
- HRB-CICER also develop and deliver training as required, since the last NCEC update they have delivered the following:
 - Overview of the NCEC guideline development and quality assurance process (National Patient Safety Conference, November 2022).
 - GRADE and Evidence to Decision Framework training provided to the HIQA Medical Exposure to Ionising Radiation Expert Advisory Group (February 2023).
 - Half day teaching session to RCSI postgraduate students on GRADE and Evidence to Decision Framework training (March 2023).
- Planned training also includes delivery of training to the CEU on GRADE and the Evidence to Decision Framework (June 2023).
- Since the last NCEC update there have been eight conference presentations and six peer-reviewed manuscripts published.

10. National Standards for Clinical Practice

CEU presented a discussion paper on the update on the review of the NCEC National Standards on Clinical Practice Guidance (circulated in advance). The update included that to inform the update of the standards, and in line with the NCEC decision of October 2022, the Clinical Effectiveness Unit (CEU) have adopted a three-pronged approach to the review:

1. Update of a systematic review originally performed in 2015 to inform the standards.
2. Targeted external stakeholder consultation exercise.
3. Formation of an expert advisory group.

A status update on each of the three steps was provided.

11. NCEC Events

CEU gave an update on recent and upcoming NCEC events:

- a. HSE Sepsis Summit is on 19th September in Dublin Castle
- b. NPSO Conference is on 19th October in Dublin Castle

- c. NCG No. 30 Guideline on Infection Prevention and Control was launched on 11th May in the Department of Health

12. AOB

Rosarie Lynch announced that she would be leaving the Department of Health in later in the month to take up a new position in HIQA. Gerry thanked Rosarie for all her work and commitment to NCEC over the last number of years.

Agreed actions

No.	Summary	Responsible person/s
1.	Further analysis of NCEC quality assurance process 2015 to demonstrate number of guidelines that underwent multiple reviews.	CEU
2.	Prioritisation report and letter to issue the Chair of CG-063 (Obesity in Adults- Adapted Clinical Practice Guideline for Ireland) outlining the NCEC decision. CEU to engage with the GDG to progress the guideline to stage 3 of the Framework for Endorsement of NCEC NCGs.	CEU
3.	Circulate SlideDoc on the Strategic Review following meeting	CEU